A Legislative and Regulatory Update on Environmental Issues in New York State

March 22, 2023
Capital District Regional Planning Commission

Terresa Bakner, Esq.
Molly Parlin, Esq.
State Implementation of the CLCPA

(aka the “Climate Law”)
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

Facts:
– Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
– Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
  • Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
  • Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
  • Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

70% of the State's electricity will be generated by renewable energy by 2030
100% zero-emissions electricity by 2040

Climate Leadership & Community Protection Act
  - signed into law & directs the formation of the Climate Action Council

2019
  - March
  - The 22-member Climate Action Council held its first meeting

2020
  - 2020 and 2021
  - Seven sector-specific Advisory Panels met & developed recommendations for a Draft Scoping Plan
  - Stakeholder outreach conducted & feedback submitted

2021
  - April–June
  - Draft Scoping Plan was prepared & released following nearly 20 public meetings of the Climate Action Council
  - An Integration Analysis outlining costs and benefits of the Plan was developed

2022
  - Jan–July
  - Public comment period held to receive feedback on the Scoping Plan;
    - 11 public hearings and 35,000+ written comments
  - Subgroups of the Climate Action Council met to discuss sectors of the Plan and work to reach consensus
  - Dec 19, 2022
  - Climate Action Council voted to advance the Scoping Plan to advance New York’s nation-leading climate goals.

/ WOH.COM
Efforts Focused on Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions Statewide

• State agencies will consider consistency with the statewide greenhouse gas emission limits under the Climate Act in all administrative decision-making, including permits.

• Air Permit Guidance: Applicants must provide objective analysis of the GHG and CO2e emissions from the project, including any upstream or downstream emissions. If a project is found to increase GHG emissions, the Applicant must propose alternatives or GHG mitigation measures from the facility owner or operator.

• Energy efficiency standards for certain appliances and electrification of new and altered buildings.
Advanced Building Codes, Appliance and Equipment Efficiency Standards Act of 2022
(effective June 28, 2023)

- NYSERDA, in consultation with the Department of State, is required to adopt efficiency standards for products and appliances that reduce energy and/or water consumption.

- First batch of standards will take effect on June 26, 2023 and covers:
  - Air purifiers
  - Commercial battery chargers
  - Commercial dishwashers
  - Commercial fryers
  - Commercial hot food holding cabinets
  - Commercial ovens
  - Commercial steam cookers
  - Computers
  - Computer monitors
  - Electric vehicle supply equipment (EVSE)
  - Faucets
  - Linear fluorescent lamps
  - Gas fireplaces
  - Lawn spray sprinklers
  - Replacement dedicated-purpose pool pump motors
  - Portable electric spas
  - Residential Ventilation fans
  - Showerheads
  - Toilets
  - Urinals
  - Water coolers
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

• Fact:
  - Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
  - Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
    • Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
    • Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
    • Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration
  - State energy conservation construction code shall prohibit infrastructure, building systems, or equipment used for the combustion of fossil fuels in new construction statewide no later than December 31, 2023 if the building is less than seven stories and July 1, 2027 if the building is seven stories or more.

All-Electric Building Act
  (in committee)

  • State energy conservation construction code shall prohibit infrastructure, building systems, or equipment used for the combustion of fossil fuels in new construction statewide no later than December 31, 2023 if the building is less than seven stories and July 1, 2027 if the building is seven stories or more.

Gas Transition and Affordable Energy Act
  (in committee)

  • Removes the legal basis and subsidies driving the expansion of gas systems and requires the PSC to adopt rules and develop a statewide gas service transition plan that aligns with decreasing gas sales and, where appropriate, the decommissioning of the gas system.
Disadvantaged Communities
Criteria for Disadvantaged Communities

- The Climate Act charged the Climate Justice Working Group (CJWG) with the development of criteria to identify disadvantaged communities.

- The CJWG used 45 indicators to identify 35% of New York State census tracts as disadvantaged communities.

- The indicators include climate-related risks, such as flooding or extreme heat, health vulnerabilities like asthma and COPD, and emergency department visits, as well as several socio-economic factors including race, ethnicity, and income.
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

**Facts:**
- Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
- Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
  - Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
  - Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
  - Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

---

**Table 1. Percentage of census tracts in each region designated a draft DAC**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>% of tracts identified as draft DACs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Island</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Hudson</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western NY</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finger Lakes</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital Region</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central NY</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Tier</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohawk Valley</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Country</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>35%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

• Facts:
  – Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
  – Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
    • Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
    • Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
    • Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

Table 2. Environmental burdens and climate change risks: Draft Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Land use and facilities associated with historical discrimination or disinvestment</th>
<th>Potential climate change risks</th>
<th>Potential pollution exposures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to remediation sites</td>
<td>Extreme heat projections</td>
<td>Vehicle traffic density diesel truck and bus traffic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to regulated management plan sites</td>
<td>Flooding in coastal and tidally influenced areas (projected)</td>
<td>Particulate matter (PM2.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to major oil storage facilities</td>
<td>Flooding in inland areas (projected)</td>
<td>Benzene concentration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to power generation facilities</td>
<td>Low vegetative cover</td>
<td>Wastewater discharge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to active landfills</td>
<td>Agricultural land</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to municipal waste combustors</td>
<td>Driving time to hospitals or urgent/critical care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to scrap metal processors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial/manufacturing/mining land use</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing vacancy rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population Characteristics and Health Vulnerabilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent &lt;80% area median income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent &lt;100% of federal poverty line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent without bachelor’s degree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race and Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Latino/a or Hispanic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Black or African American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Asian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Native American or Indigenous</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health Outcomes &amp; Sensitivities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asthma emergency department visits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COPD emergency department visits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heart attack (MI) hospitalization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Premature deaths</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Housing Mobility &amp; Communications</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent renter-occupied homes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing cost burden (rental costs)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy poverty / cost burden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactured homes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2023 Environmental Siting Bill
(takes effect December 30, 2024)

- Amends SEQRA to define and include various requirements for examining impacts to Disadvantaged Communities.

- Initial Determinations (on whether EIS is needed) must consider whether the project “may cause or increase a disproportionate burden on a disadvantaged community.”

- EIS must assess the effects of an action on disadvantaged communities, including whether the action would cause or increase a “disproportionate pollution burden.”
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands
185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep’t 2020)

Facts:
– Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
– Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board’s site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
  • Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
  • Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
  • Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

2023 Environmental Siting Bill
(takes effect December 30, 2024)

• Amends Uniform Procedures Act to require major regulatory programs of NYSDEC to prepare an Existing Burden Report.

• An Existing Burden Report describes the existing pollution burden in a disadvantaged community.

• Permits shall not be approved or renewed if it “may cause or contribute to, directly or indirectly, a disproportionate / inequitable pollution burden on a disadvantaged community.”
Enhanced Protection of Natural Resources
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

Facts:
- Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
- Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
  - Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
  - Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
  - Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

Enhanced Wetland Protections
Revised Federal Definition of Waters of the United States (WOTUS) (takes effect March 20, 2023)

- traditional navigable waters, the territorial seas, and interstate waters (¶ (a)(1) waters)
- impoundments of “waters of the United States” (¶ (a)(2) impoundments)
- tributaries to traditional navigable waters, the territorial seas, interstate waters, impoundments when the tributaries meet either the relatively permanent standard or the significant nexus standard (“jurisdictional tributaries”)
  - wetlands adjacent to ¶ (a)(1) waters, wetlands adjacent to and with a continuous surface connection to relatively permanent ¶ (a)(2) impoundments, wetlands adjacent to tributaries that meet the relatively permanent standard, and wetlands adjacent to ¶ (a)(2) impoundments or jurisdictional tributaries when the wetlands meet the significant nexus standard (“jurisdictional adjacent wetlands”); and
  - intrastate lakes and ponds, streams, or wetlands not identified in ¶ (a)(1) - (4) that meet either the relatively permanent standard or the significant nexus standard (“¶ (a)(5) waters”).
Revised NYS Definition of Freshwater Wetlands (effective January 1, 2025)

- Definition no longer relies on the Freshwater Wetlands Map, which now merely depicts the “approximate location” of wetlands and is “not necessarily determinative as to whether a permit is required.”

- Lands and waters of the state, that are not tidal wetlands, that have an area of at least twelve and four-tenths acres or, if less than twelve and four-tenths acres in size, are of unusual importance, and which contain any of the criteria specified (e.g. marshes, swamps, bogs, etc., lands enclosed by aquatic vegetation, waters overlying these areas).
Federal Protections for Northern Long-Eared Bat
(status change from Threatened to Endangered Species, effective March 23, 2023)
State Attempts to Take Over Local Zoning Jurisdiction
Solar and Wind Utility Scale Projects

- Office of Renewable Energy Siting (ORES) created to consolidate the environmental review and permitting of major renewable energy facilities in New York State
Favre v. Planning Board of Town of Highlands, 185 A.D.3d 681 (2d Dep't 2020)

• Facts:
  – Project involved 86-room, 4-story hotel and restaurant
  – Adjacent property owners (petitioners) challenged Planning Board's site plan approval and grant of special exception use permit contending that:
    • Planning Board was required to hold another public hearing on revised site plans
    • Planning Board was required to re-refer application for site plan approval and special exception use permit to county planning board after revisions
    • Planning Board failed to comply with SEQRA in issuing Negative Declaration

• 2023 NYS Budget includes a $25 billion, five-year housing plan to create/preserve 100,000 affordable homes across the State
Comments or Questions?

Contact:

Terresa Bakner – Tbakner@woh.com; 518-487-7615

Molly Parlin – Mparln@woh.com; 518-487-7602

Whiteman Osterman & Hanna LLP
One Commerce Plaza, Suite 1900
Albany, N.Y. 12260
518-487-7600
www.woh.com

DISCLAIMER: This is an outline of issues and potential issues and is not intended as legal advice; this presentation is no substitute for legal advice and analysis from experienced counsel for your municipality.

Copyright ©2023 Whiteman Osterman & Hanna LLP
All rights reserved.